

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, August 16, 2010 David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street 3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS: PAUL ZINK, CHAIR

GLEN DEISLER, VICE-CHAIR

BERNI BERNSTEIN
ERIN CARROLL
BRIAN MILLER
DENISE WOOLERY
JIM ZIMMERMAN

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: MICHAEL JORDAN

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor

TONY BOUGHMAN, Planning Technician GLORIA SHAFER, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD OF REVIEW SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See SFDB Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street) Photographs - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. Plans - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations - (Include on first drawing) Site Plan - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. Exterior elevations - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	Site Sections - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. Plans - floor, roof, etc. Rough sketches are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: Plans - floor, roof, etc. Site Sections - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. Preliminary Landscape Plans - required for commercial & multi-family; single-family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	Color & Material Samples - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. Exterior Details - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: Color & Material Samples - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. Cut Sheets - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. Exterior Details - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Final Landscape Plans - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. Consultant/Engineer Plans - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following Single Family Design Board of Review (SFDB) agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, a rescheduling fee will be paid and the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) in addition to submitting appropriate plans.
- All approvals made by the SFDB are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.68 and with adopted SFDB guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- The SFDB may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- The Board may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final SFDB approval.
- Conceptual comments are valid for one year. Preliminary SFDB approval is valid for one year from the date of the
 approval unless a time extension has been granted. Final SFDB approval is valid for two years from the date of final
 action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- **APPEALS:** Decisions of the SFDB may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall, 735 Anacapa St. within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Board took action or rendered its decision.
- **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at (805)564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS: Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/sfdb. Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the SFDB after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours. If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Tony Boughman at (805) 564-5470 extension 4539, or by email at tobughman@santabarbaraca.gov. Our office hours are 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the city of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- 1. On Thursday, August 12, 2010, this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov.
- 2. This regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board will be broadcast live on City TV-18, or on your computer via http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video/ and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. City TV-18 will also rebroadcast this meeting in its entirety the following Wednesday morning at 8:00 a.m. An archived video copy of this meeting will be viewable on computers with high speed internet access the following Wednesday at www.santabarbaraca.gov/sfdb and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:02 p.m.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Bernstein (in at 3:15, out from 3:50 to 4:05), Carroll, Deisler, Miller, Woolery,

Zimmerman, Zink

Members absent: None

Staff present: Boughman, Limon (left at 3:14), Shafer

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of August 2, 2010, as

amended.

Action: Carroll/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein absent.)

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of August 9, 2010. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Paul

Zink with the exception of the landscaping reviewed by Denise Woolery.

Action: Woolery/Deisler, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein absent.)

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of August 16, 2010. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Glen

Deisler with the exception of the landscaping reviewed by Denise Woolery.

Action: Woolery/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein absent.)

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.
 - 1. Mr. Boughman announced that he will begin staffing the ABR and Michelle Bedard will staff the SFDB.
 - 2. Jaime Limon provided an update of the remodel of 2222 Santa Barbara Street. He explained that Building Division's Plan Check triggered structural upgrades which required complete building demolition in order to meet the new structural codes. He stated that, in this case, per the City Attorney, because this project was approved and a permit issued, it will not return to the SFDB. Mr. Limon added that procedures will be revised to ensure that future projects involving complete demolition return for additional review and noticing.
- E. Subcommittee Reports.

None.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

1. 380 EL CIELITO RD A-1 Zone

(3:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-082-004 Application Number: MST2010-00211

Owner: Frank and Lynn Kirk Revocable Trust

(Proposal for 617 feet of six foot tall galvanized chain link fence along Cielito Lane. Trumpet vines are proposed to be planted on the fence. The project will abate violations in ENF2010-00374.)

(Second review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 3:14 p.m.

Present: Lynn and Frank Kirk, Owners.

Public comment was opened at 3:22 p.m.

Graham Lyons, Attorney representing several neighbors, opposed: the original permit was issued in error, and the project should be reviewed as if it had not yet been built. Concerns include disturbance of Oak trees, landscaping to hide the fence, interference with natural drainage, and neighborhood compatibility. The chain link fence is inconsistent with the Design Guidelines.

Two letters in support of the project from Caroline Santandrea and Denise Waid, and two letters in opposition from Norah McMeeking and Paula Westbury were acknowledged.

Public comment was closed at 3:31 p.m.

Motion:

Preliminary Approval of the project with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance and Hillside Design District criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code return to Consent Calendar with the following comments:

- 1) The reduction in fence height to 4' is appreciated.
- 2) The approved dark fence color is identified on the unnumbered color board with a dot.
- 3) Provide a landscape plan indicating the quantity and species and container sizes of proposed planting. The proposed Manzanita and Lemonberry shrubs are acceptable.
- 4) Provide information about drainage swales and how the fence will traverse.
- 5) The City Arborist is to conduct a site visit. Incorporate the Arborist's recommendations onto the plans.
- 6) The project provides appropriate grading and natural topography protection; the development scale is appropriate.
- 7) The project will be consistent and appearance will enhance the neighborhood; development is compatible with the neighborhood in bulk and scale; provides quality material and colors which will maintain compatibility of the area; tree removal is not proposed; no adverse impact to public health & safety; complies fairly well with good neighbor guidelines; preserves the public scenic view of the hillside.

Action: Miller/Deisler, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

2. 1131 LOS PUEBLOS RD E-3 Zone

(3:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-071-028 Application Number: MST2010-00079

Owner: Richard W. and Vera J. Scheef Family Trust

Architect: Bryan Murphy

(Proposal to demolish 564 square feet of floor area and construct a 1,030 square addition to an existing two-story 2,258 square foot single-family residence. The existing one-car garage and one-car carport will be replaced with an attached 500 square foot two-car garage. Three redwood trees are proposed to be removed. A new retaining wall is proposed in the rear yard. The proposed total of 3,172 square feet on the 15,921 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 75% of the maximum guideline floor to lot area ratio. Staff Hearing Officer approval of a modification is requested for the proposed deck and stairs to encroach into the front setback.)

(Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 034-10.)

Actual time: 3:47 p.m.

Present: Bryan Murphy, Architect.

Public comment was opened at 3:55 p.m.

A letter in opposition from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion:

Preliminary Approval of the project with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and return to the Full Board for inprogress review with the following comments:

- 1) Show varied heights to the top ridge lines.
- 2) Simplify the tower and buttress.
- 3) Study the scale of front entry arch.
- 4) Study reducing the height of the chimney.
- 5) Provide a landscape plan.
- 6) Show gutters, downspouts, and leaders on the elevations.
- 7) Provide a color board.
- 8) The project will be consistent and appearance will enhance the neighborhood; development is compatible; provides quality architecture and materials; it is understood that the Redwood tree to be removed will be replaced with a new tree in the front yard.

Action: Zimmerman/Miller, 6/0/1. Motion carried. (Bernstein abstained.)

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW

3. 921 ARBOLADO RD A-1 Zone

(4:00)Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-251-003

Application Number: MST2010-00053 Owner: Fristoe Family Trust Architect: Don Nulty, AIA

(This is a revised project description: Proposal to construct a new 3,760 square foot, two-story singlefamily residence with attached 566 square foot two-car garage. Also proposed is a new swimming pool, a 392 square foot cabana, approximately 1,400 square feet of attached terraces, three detached garden terraces, related hardscaping and site walls, and approximately 300 cubic yards of cut and fill grading. The existing 2,730 square foot two-story single-family residence and attached 382 square foot two-car garage will be demolished. The proposed total of 4,718 square feet on the 36,765 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 97% of the maximum guideline floor to lot area ratio which includes a 50% deduction of basement square footage.)

(Review of landscaping and colors and materials.)

Actual time: 4:08 p.m.

Present: Lane Goodkind, Landscape Architect; Robert Foley, representing Don Nulty, Architect;

Dave Fristoe, Owner.

Public comment was opened at 4:14 p.m.

A letter in opposition from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Preliminary Approval of the landscaping and continued to Consent Calendar with

the following comments:

1) Remove the Italian Cypress from the landscape plan.

- 2) Obtain Fire Department approval stamp for the landscape plan.
- 3) Provide driveway material information.

Carroll/Woolery, 7/0/0. Motion carried. Action:

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

4. 526 SEA RANCH DR A-1/SD-3 Zone

August 16, 2010

(4:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-021-017

Application Number: MST2009-00447 Owner: Dan Clause

Landscape Architect: Sam Maphis
Architect: Don Nulty

(Proposal for additions and remodeling for an existing 2,277 square foot one-story single-family residence and attached 519 square foot two-car garage. Additions consist of 923 square feet on the first floor, and a new 410 square foot second-story. The proposed total of 4,129 square feet on the 1.6 acre lot in the Hillside Design District is 78% of the maximum guideline floor to lot area ratio. Proposed new construction also includes drainage improvements at orchard and grading for additions and auto court. The project includes abatement of violations in enforcement case ENF2008-00922 by permitting as-built work consisting of 700 cubic yards of fill grading for orchard, and drainage, paving, landscaping and retaining wall.)

(Second review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 4:21 p.m.

Present: Sam Maphis, Landscape Architect; Robert Foley representing Don Nulty, Architect; Dan

Clause, Owner.

Public comment was opened at 4:27 p.m.

Pam Lang: opposed to the second-story balcony.

An e-mail expressing concerns from Barbara and Art Langlois, and a letter in opposition from Paula Westbury were acknowledged.

Public comment was closed at 4:32 p.m.

Straw vote: how many board members can support the two-story element: 6/1/0. (Woolery opposed.)

Motion: Preliminary Approval of the architecture and landscaping of the project with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and return to the Full Board for in-progress review with the following comments:

- 1) Provide a roofing material sample.
- 2) Provide wall sections.
- 3) Update hardscape information.
- 4) Provide completed plans.
- 5) Study the view from the balcony toward the neighbor's property; provide screening options.
- 6) Show tier 3 Storm Water Management Program compliance.
- 7) The project provides consistency and appearance will enhance the neighborhood; is compatible with the neighborhood; provides quality architecture; abates an existing enforcement case.

Action: Deisler/Woolery, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was acknowledged.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

5. 3020 SERENA RD E-3/SD-2 Zone

(4:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-172-010 Application Number: MST2010-00235

Owner: David Mendro and Patrice Surmier

(Proposal for a new 766 square foot second-story addition and a 359 square foot first floor addition to an existing 1,370 square foot one-story single-family residence. The existing 468 square foot attached two-car garage will be demolished and replaced with an attached 456 square foot two-car garage. The proposed total of 2,951 square feet on the 10,948 square foot lot is 77% of the maximum floor to lot area ratio.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 5:00 p.m.

Present: David Mendro and Patrice Surmier, Owners.

Public comment was opened at 5:07 p.m.

A letter in opposition from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Preliminary Approval of the project with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code return to Consent Calendar with the following comments:

- 1) Revise the cantilevered area over the garage.
- 2) Study the window above the garage for added interest.
- 3) Provide photographs showing example of shingle siding in the neighborhood.
- 4) Project is neighborhood compatible in size, bulk and scale; provides quality architecture; provides consistency in appearance with the neighborhood.

Action: Bernstein/Miller, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

The Board recessed from 5:20 until 5:22 p.m.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

6. 575 W MOUNTAIN DR A-1 Zone

(5:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-110-014

Application Number: MST2010-00164

Owner: Jill Stein and David Unger

Architect: Roderick Britton

(Proposal for two uncovered parking spaces and to legalize the as-built removal of a two-car carport. The proposal includes permitting the as-built 5 foot high steel entry gate and relocating a 120 square foot storage shed to conform to the setback to abate violations in ENF2010-00363. The proposed total of 2,413 square feet on the 1.2 acre lot in the Hillside Design District is 48% of the maximum guideline floor to lot area ratio.)

(Fourth review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 5:22 p.m.

Present: Jill Stein and David Unger, Co-Owners.

Public comment was opened at 5:30 p.m.

A letter in support from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Straw vote: how many can support the proposal for uncovered parking 4/3/1 (Miller/Deisler and Bernstein opposed. Zink abstained.)

Motion: Final Approved of the project as submitted with the following comments:

- 1) The applicant's patience of the case by case review process is appreciated.
- 2) The project is neighborhood compatible; the uncovered parking is screened on all sides and is in keeping with the Parking Ordinance.

Action: Woolery/Carroll, 4/2/1. Motion carried (Bernstein/Deisler opposed. Zink abstained.)

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

ADJOURNMENT

The Full Board meeting was adjourned at 5:44 p.m.

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)

NEW ITEM

A. 874 W MOUNTAIN DR A-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-050-018 Application Number: MST2010-00224

Owner: Kristina M. Eriksen-Post Trust

Architect: Karl Kras
Contractor: Penn Estes

(Proposal to replace a 2,580 square foot two-story house and 600 square foot garage that were destroyed in the Tea Fire. Proposed is a 3,024 square foot two-story single-family residence and a detached 400 square foot carport in the same building footprint with minimal grading. The proposed total of 3,424 square feet on the 4.4 acre lot in the Hillside Design District is 50% of the maximum guideline floor to lot area ratio.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

A public comment letter in support from Shira Musicant, and a letter in opposition from Paula Westbury were acknowledged.

Preliminary Approval as submitted with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with the following comments: 1) The size, bulk and scale are acceptable; project has the same footprint as prior structure. 2) Provide revised elevations showing parking. 3) Transportation staff is to review parking. 4) Fire Department to review landscaping plan. 5) Provide a color board.

NEW ITEM

B. 468 CONEJO RD A-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-061-017 Application Number: MST2010-00234 Owner: Peter Jon Amstutz

Architect: Lori Kari

(Proposal to construct a new one-story 1,210 square foot single-family residence. A 300 square foot garage is being replaced like-for-like under a separate permit. Staff Hearing Officer approval of modifications is requested for the house to encroach into the front and interior setbacks. The proposed total of 1,510 square feet on the 9,778 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 42% of the maximum floor to lot area ratio. A house and garage on this site were destroyed in the Tea Fire.)

(Comments only; project requires Staff Hearing Officer review of modifications.)

A letter in opposition from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer with the following comments: 1) The project is primarily like for like. Structural and cost reasons result in an expansion of the building. 2) Clarify on plans that everything outside of garage is part of this application. The understanding is that the garage and deck above it are not in the scope of this project. 3) Provide a sample of roofing material. 4) Restudy the front stairs. 5) Provide a landscaping plan.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

C. 501 CONEJO RD A-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-062-011 Application Number: MST2009-00269

Owner: Michael B. and Kathleen M. Szymanski

Designer: Ubaldo Diaz

(This project is returning for a Review After Final to increase the second-floor by 506 square feet and the first-floor by 50 square feet. The original project description follows: Proposal to replace a one-story 1,174 square foot house and detached 323 square foot garage destroyed in the Tea Fire. Proposed is a 1,823 square foot two-story single family residence and attached 510 square foot two-car garage. Staff Hearing Officer approval of a modification is requested to allow altering and relocating the garage and altering the house in the front setback. The proposed total of 2,333 square feet on the 11,190 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 60% of the maximum floor to lot area ratio.)

(Second review of Review After Final to increase the second-floor by 500 square feet and the first-floor by 163 square feet.)

A letter in opposition from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Approval of the Review After Final with conditions: 1) Show windows to be metal clad as shown in the prior approval. 2) Specify roof shingles. 3) Study egress requirements.

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by Glen Deisler, with landscaping reviewed by Denise Woolery. Staff present: Tony Boughman, Planning Technician II.